# SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT DISCRETIONARY APPEALS Grants & Denials List

Monday, October 24, 2005

## **GRANTS**

STYLE/APPEAL NUMBER	COUNTY TRIAL JUDGE TRIAL COURT NO.	APPELLATE JUDGE JUDGMENT	NATURE OF APPEAL	ACTION			
<u>Nashville</u>							
Rearno Vaughn v. State of Tennessee M2004-00544-SC-R11-PC &  James A. Vaughn v. State of Tennessee M2004-00458-SC-R11-PC	Sumner, Criminal Jane Wheatcraft 65-1999 & CR64-1999	Wedemeyer, J Affirmed & Wedemeyer, J Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11's	Granted - Application of <i>pro se</i> Rearno Vaughn.  Granted - Application of James A. Vaughn. (Granted - October 3, 2005)  * The facts and the legal issue in these cases are identical, so they are consolidated for oral argument purposes.*			

Knoxville						
Mary Jane Chambers, et al. v. John R. Semmer, M.D., et al. E2005-01519-SC-S09-CV	Knox Circuit Harold Wimberly 2-768-02	Susano, J Swiney, J Lee, J.J Rule 9 Denied	Rule 9	Granted - Application of John R. Semmer, M.D., and Kenneth Cofer, M.D.		
<u>Jackson</u>						
None						

## SUPREME COURT OF TENNESSEE SUPREME COURT DISCRETIONARY APPEALS

Monday, October 24, 2005

## **DENIALS**

STYLE/APPEAL NUMBER	COUNTY	APPELLATE	NATURE	ACTION
	TRIAL JUDGE	JUDGE	OF	
	TRIAL COURT NO.	JUDGMENT	APPEAL	

#### **Nashville** Ora Aschbacher v. Peggy Ann Woods Coffee Chancery Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Peggy Ann Inman, J M2003-02616-SC-R11-CV L. Craig Johnson Reversed and Woods. 00-271 Remanded William Brown v. State of Tennessee Williamson Circuit McLin, J. **Denied** - Application of William Brown. Rule 11 M2004-01898-SC-R11-PC R. E. Lee Davies Affirmed 203-080 Cannon County Board of Education Cannon Chancery Clement, J Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Goldy Wade Goldy Wade and Cannon County Robert E. Corlew, III Vacated and and Cannon County Education **Education Association** 02 - 102Remanded Association. M2003-02260-SC-R11-CV Willie Tom Ensley v. State of Tennessee **Davidson Criminal** Williams, J Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Willie Tom M2003-02831-SC-R11-PC Walter Kurtz Affirmed Ensley. 85-W-584 Rule 11 Joseph Tyree Glanton, Jr. a/k/a **Rutherford Chancery** Koch, J **Denied** - Application of Joseph Tyree Songoleke Kotunu, et al. Affirmed and Royce Taylor Glanton, Jr., a/k/a Songoleke Kotunu, M2002-02363-SC-R11-CV 01-3717CV Luvell L Glanton, and Jerry Glanton. Remanded Luvell L. Glanton v. Bob Parks Realty, Williamson Circuit Cottrell, J Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Luvell L. Lucy Bottorf, Sharon Cummings and Russ Heldman Affirmed as Glanton.

Modified

Ogle, J

Affirmed

Clement, J

Affirmed

Rule 11

Rule 11

Harris.

Holland.

1-2K635

**Davidson Criminal** 

**Davidson Circuit** 

Carol Soloman

Steve Dozier

89-S-1189

02C-284

Legacy Properties, LLC.

M2004-539-SC-R11-PC

M2003-01807-Sc-R11-CV

Warden

Center, L.L.C.

M2003-01144-SC-R11-CV

Anthony L. Harris v. Wayne Bandon

Cory D. Holland v. Packard's Service

**Denied** - Application of Anthony L.

**Denied** - Application of Cory D.

Laboratory Corporation of America v. Dr. Arikana Chihombori and Bell Family Medical Center, Inc. M2004-02946-SC-R11-CV	Rutherford Chancery 02-5420CV	Cain, J. Cottrell, J Clement, J Dismissed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Dr. Arikana Chihombori.
Gary Lee Miller v. State of Tennessee M2004-00987-SC-R11-PC	Davidson Criminal Seth Norman 97-B-784	Witt, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Gary Lee Miller.
Terry Lee Robinson v. State of Tennessee M2004-00555-SC-R11-PC	Davidson Criminal Cheryl Blackburn 98-B-1539	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Terry L. Robinson.
Robert Swafford Shofner v. Ann Margaret Kalisz M2003-01550-SC-R11-CV	Davidson Criminal Muriel Robinson 01D-971	Koch, J Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Ann Margaret Kalisz Shofner.
State of Tennessee v. Charles Edward Buchanan M2004-01127-SC-R11-CO	Williamson Circuit Timothy Easter CR041059	Wedemeyer, J Welles, J Smith, J Denied	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Charles Edward Buchanan.
State of Tennessee v. Ronald Lynn Chatman M2003-00806-SC-R11-CD	Robertson Circuit Michael R. Jones 01-0494	Woodall, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Ronald Lynn Chatman.  ** The opinion of the Court of Criminal Appeals is designated "Not for Citation" in accordance with Supreme Court Rule 4, § F.**
State of Tennessee v. Barry Wayne Dunham M2003-02802-SC-R11-CD	Macon Criminal J.O. Bond 97-71	Glenn, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Barry Wayne Dunham.
State of Tennessee v. William O. Ewerling M2003-00595-SC-R11-CD	Davidson Criminal Seth Norman 2002-B-1164	Hayes, J Affirmed in Part; Reversed in Part	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of William O. Ewerling.

State of Tennessee v. Kevin Ford & Clifford Wright M2003-00957-SC-R11-CD	Davidson Criminal J. Randall Wyatt, Jr. 2001-A-600 & 601	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Kevin Dewitt Ford.
State of Tennessee v. David Gordon M2005-01067-SC-S10-CO	Marshall Circuit Franklin L. Russell 15802	Wedemeyer, J Welles, J Smith, J Rule 10 Denied	Rule 10	<b>Denied</b> - Application of David Gordon.
State of Tennessee v. Joseph Vermeal M2004-00046-SC-R11-CD	Warren Circuit Larry B. Stanley, Jr. F-8351	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Joseph Vermeal.
Kevin Q. Whittemore v. State of Tennessee M2005-00080-SC-R11-HC	Sumner Criminal Jane E. Wheatcraft 1124-2004	Smith, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Kevin Q. Whittemore.  *Motion in Abeyance also denied.*
James William Taylor, a/k/a Lutfi Shafq Talal v. State of Tennessee M2004-02302-SC-R11-PC	Williamson Circuit Donal P. Harris CR04273	Woodall, J Affirmed Rule 20	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of James William Taylor, a/k/a Lutfi Shafq Talal.
Dorothy Tucker v. Sierra Builders and All American Homes, and Individually Craid Medlin M2003-02372-SC-R11-CV	Wilson Circuit Clara W. Byrd 11591	Koch, J Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Dorothy Tucker.
Ronald Irvin Watson v. Cynthia Ann Bode Watson M2003-02398-SC-R11-CV	Sumner Circuit C.L. Rogers 29378-C	Crawford, J Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Cynthia (Watson)Clark.
Raymond P. White, et al. v. Hickman County, Tennessee M2004- 00232-SC-R11-CV	Hickman Chancery Timothy L. Easter 0015226	Cain, J Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Raymond P. White, deceased, Maxine P. White, Tommy Turman, Thomas E. Newhouse, Paul F. Luther, Charles R. Holt, and Marshall Lampley.

Wylie Steel Fabricators, Inc. v. Ruth E. Johnson, Commissioner of Revenue M2003-02482-SC-R11-CV	Davidson Chancery Irvin H. Kilcrease, Jr. 02-275-I	Highers, J Affirmed in Part; Reversed & Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Wylie Steel Fabricators.
	Kno	<u>xville</u>		
Kathy Brown, et al. v. Clint Seal, et al. E2004-01499-SC-R11-CV	Hancock Chancery Thomas R. Frierson, II 01-8531	Swiney, J Reversed & Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Clint Seal, and Tony and Patricia Seal.
Linda June Cross v. State of Tennessee E2003-01969-SC-R11-PC	Cumberland Circuit Leon C. Burns, Jr. 3187	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Linda June Cross.  * Motion to proceed in forma pauperis is granted.*  * Motion for appointment of counsel is denied. *
Jerome William Devereaux v. State of Tennessee E2004-01891-SC-R11-PC	Jefferson Circuit O. Duane Slone 18, 683	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of the Jerome William Devereaux.
Erika East v. State of Tennessee M2003-02329-SC-R11-PC	Rutherford Circuit Don R. Ash F-53617	Wedemeyer, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Erika East.
Becky Elliott v. Donna Akey, Individually, and d/b/a Owner of Plaza Restaurant E2004-01478-SC-R11-CV	Blount Circuit W. Dale Young L-14016	Lee, J Affirmed in Part, Reversed in Part	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Becky Ellitott.
Glenda Emmit v. Richard Emmit, et al. E2004-00201-SC-R11-CV	Bledsoe Circuit Buddy D. Perry 3586	Susano, J Reversed & Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Helen Medley and Omie Ray Medley.

Wayne M. Fuller v. State of Tennessee E2004-03021-SC-R11-PC	Knox Criminal Ray Jenkins 80448	Witt, J Wade, J Ogle, J Dismissed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Wayne M. Fuller.
Eric Gilmore v. State of Tennesse E2004-01917-SC-R11-PC	Knox Criminal Ray Jenkins 79459	Ogle, J Affirmed Pursuant to Rule 20	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Eric Gilmore.
Thomas Eugene Graham v. State of Tennessee E2004-02958-SC-R11-PC	Hamilton Criminal Stephen M. Bevil 215735	Wade, P.J. Affirmed Pursuant to Rule 20	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Thomas Eugene Graham.
David Johnson Hartsell v. State of Tennessee E2004-02876-SC-R11-HC	Johnson Circuit Lynn W. Brown 4469	Ogle, J Tipton, J Witt, J Affirmed Pursuant to Rule 20	Rule 11	Denied - Application of <i>pro se</i> David Johnson Hartsell.  * Motions to suspend requirements of T.R.A.P.; for stay pending appeal; for review of denial of bail also denied.*
Nathan Henderson, et al. v. Quest Expeditions, Inc. E2004-02585-SC-R11-CV	Polk Circuit John B. Hagler CV-03-130	Franks, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Nathan Henderson and Brandy Henderson.
Lee Ketchersid v. Rhea County Board of Education E2004-01153-SC-R11-CV	Rhea Chancery Jeffrey F. Stewart 9699	Susano, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Lee Ketchersid.
David Bruce Myers v. Teri Lynne Brown Myers E2004-01362-SC-R11-CV	Greene Circuit Ben K. Wexler 03-CV-924	Franks, J Affirmed a & Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Teri Lynne Brown Myers.

Frankie Ann Rolen, et al. v. Wood Presbyterian Home, Inc. E2004-00952-SC-R11-CV	Monroe Circuit Lawrence Howard Puckett V99290P	Franks, J Affirmed in Part & Reversed in Part & Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Wood Presbyterian Home, Inc.
Roy C. Smith v. James A. Bowlen, Warden, and the State of Tennessee E2004-00833-SC-R11-HC	Bledsoe Circuit J. Curtis Smith 1-2003	Smith, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of the State of Tennessee.
State of Tennessee v. Terry Edward Jones E2004-01300-SC-R11-CD	Sullivan Circuit Phyllis Miller S46,436	Witt, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Terry Edward Jones.
State of Tennessee v. Frank Peter Pinchak E2004-01184-SC-R11-CD	Hamilton Criminal Rebecca Stern 242161	McLin, J Reversed & Remanded	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Frank Peter Pinchak.  *Barker, C.J., Not Participating
State of Tennessee v. Rodney Southers E2004-01136-SC-R11-CD	Hamilton Criminal Stephen M. Bevil 240245	Wade, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Rodney Southers.
State of Tennessee v. Michael Lynn Stanton E2003-02675-SC-R11-CD	Knox Criminal Mary Beth Leibowitz 67854	Wade, J Reversed in Part & Affirmed in Part	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Michael Lynn Stanton.
State of Tennessee, ex rel. Steven G. Hughes v. Howard Carlton, Warden E2004-02473-SC-R11-HC	Johnson Circuit Robert E. Cupp 4188	Witt, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Steven G. Hughes.
State of Tennessee v. Vincent Marcel Williams E2004-00355-SC-R11-CD	Hamilton Criminal Stephen Bevil 238162	Tipton, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Vincent Marcel Williams.

#### **Jackson** Williams, J Larry Bohannon v. State of Tennessee **Shelby Criminal** Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Larry W2004-00961-SC-R11-PC P-27251 Affirmed Bohannon. W. Fred Axley Pursuant to Rule 20 Neil William Buettner, Jr. v. Sandra Lee Henry Chancery **Denied** - Application of Neil William Rule 11 Farmer, J Ron E. Harmon Affirmed in Buettner, Jr.. Buettner W2004-01788-SC-R11-CV 17787 Part; Reversed in Part & Remanded Witt, J Eric Bernard Chism v. State of **Madison County** Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Eric Bernard Roger A. Page Tennessee Affirmed Chism. W2004-01690-SC-R11-PC C-03-167 **Shelby Chancery** Kirby, J Rule 11 Hal Gerber v. Virginia Starr Segal **Denied** - Application of Virginia Starr W2004-00805-SC-R11-CV Arnold B. Goldin Affirmed Segal. CH-00-0893-2 Regina Helderman, and husband, Troy **Madison Circuit** Highers, J Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Matthew R. Reversed and Helderman v. Matthew R. Smolin, M.D., Don H. Allen Smolin, M.D., and Medical Specialty Clinic, P.C. et al. C-00-148 Remanded W2004-01206-SC-R11-CV In the Matter of: The Estate of Emory B. **Shelby Probate** Crawford, J Rule 11 Denied - Application of Carolyne Park-Pegram, Deceased v. Gregory Baxter Robert s. Benham Affirmed Pegram. Pegram C-9109 W2004-1179-SC-R11-CV Thomas L. Jackson v. State of Tennessee Lauderdale Circuit Wedemeyer, J Rule 11 **Denied** - Application of Thomas L. W2004-00445-SC-R11-PC Jon Kerry Blackwood Affirmed Jackson. 7248

Marvin Anthony Matthews v. David Mills, Warden W2004-02209-SC-R11-HC	Lauderdale County Joe H. Walker 5899	Hayes, J Affirmed Pursuant to Rule 20	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of <i>pro se</i> Marvin Anthony Matthews
Mary Ellen Hall McIntire v. Timothy Lapleau McIntire W2004-02904-SC-R11-CV	Shelby Circuit Karen R. Williams CT-003442-02		Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Mary Ellen Hall McIntire.
Riverside Surgery Center, LLC, et al. v. Methodist Health Systems, Inc. W2004-01195-SC-R11-CV	Dyer Chancery W. Michael Maloan 03C202	Farmer, J Affirmed and Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Methodist Health Sytems, Inc
Sandra Kaye Kemp Parish, et al. v. Jerry Donald Kemp, et al. W2003-01652-SC-R11-CV	Carroll Chancery Ron Harmon 01-CV-32	Highers, J Reversed and Remanded	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Jerry Donald Kemp and Annie Jo Kemp.
Harold Schaffer v. State of Tennessee W2004-02212-SC-R11-PC	Dyer Circuit R. Lee Moore, Jr. C99-228	McLin, J Dismissed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Harold Schaffer.
State of Tennessee v. Anthony Dwayne Brown W2004-01139-SC-R11-CD	Obion County William B. Acree, Jr. 3-338	McLin, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Anthony Dwayne Brown.
State of Tennessee v. Linda Nell Culver W2004-00376-SC-R11-CD	Henry Circuit C. Creed McGinley 13536	Welles, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Linda Nell Culver.
State of Tennessee v. Brenda Holliman W2003-01736-SC-R11-CD	Shelby Criminal W. Otis Higgs, Jr. 02-00684, 02-00685	Smith, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Brenda Holliman.
State of Tennessee v. Qawi Nur W2004-01259-SC-R11-CD	Shelby Criminal Chris Craft 02-00-06231	Woodall, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Qawi Nur.

State of Tennessee v. Anthony James Shearer W204-01774-SC-R11-CD	Obion Circuit William B. Acree, Jr. 4-71	Tipton, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Anthony James Shearer.
State of Tennessee v. Steve Cornell Snipes W2004-01619-SC-R11-CD	Haywood County Clayburn L. Peeples 5204	Glenn, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Steve Cornell Snipes.
The Alison Group, Inc. v. Greg Ericson, Individually d/b/a Ericson & Associates, et al. W2003-02973-SC-R11-CV	Shelby Circuit Karen R. Williams CT-007121-01	Highers, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Greg Ericson Individually d/b/a The Erickson Group, and The Erickson Group, Inc
Keith Dae Thomas v. State of Tennessee W2004-00080-SC-R11-PC	Madison County Roger A. Page C02-336	Ogle, J Affirmed	Rule 11	<b>Denied</b> - Application of Keith Dale Thomas.
Author Ray Turner v. State of Tennessee W2004-02582-SC-R11-CV	Tennessee Claims Comm. Nancy C. Miller-Herron 20301154	Kirby, J Affirmed	Rule 11	Denied - Application of Arthur R. Turner.  * Request that case be designated as frivolous also denied.*